

APPENDIX

*The New Order of Critical Values:  
In Which Ten of the Modern Critics of America  
Are Allowed to Substitute New Laurels for Old,  
Vanity Fair, April 1922, at cover & 40-41*

and

*Spring Elections on Mount Olympus:  
Compiled by Nine American Critics,  
The Bookman, May 1922 at cover & 285-92  
(Edward E. Paramore, Jr., ed.)*

*Ross E. Davies*



# Ranking the Olympians Before U.S. News

## The New Order of Critical Values

In Which Ten of the Modern Critics of America Are Allowed to Substitute New Laurels for Old

A GREAT Transvaluation of Values, to use the Nietzschean phrase, has recently taken place in America. A new set of Critics has arisen to take the place of the old: in Poetry, Mr. Undermyer's gang of pirates has scuttled Stedman's Anthology; in ideas, The New Republic and The Freeman have eclipsed the Atlantic Monthly of W. D. Howells; in music and painting the tranquil stream of our native talent has been disturbed by such astounding foreign bodies as Ornstein and Pichler.

It is the purpose of this page to orient the American public among the newer critical standards. The chart presents an abstract of the opinions of ten of our younger critics, and, also, a composite picture of the new critical

mind, as a whole. It is, in fact, intended as a sort of logarithm table by which the views of these celebrated authorities may be ascertained on almost any subject.

The subjects to be criticized have been chosen with a view to covering the whole field of life and thought, and the critics have been requested to assign to each of them its absolute value—in the critic's own scheme of things. The names are marked on a scale ranging between plus 25 and minus 25, the former signifying the most complete approval, and the latter, utter condemnation. A zero mark means that the critic feels, in this connection, either complete indifference or else lack of familiarity with the subject.

There is a word on the critics on the opposite page.

	BRON	MCBRIDE	MCNIVEN	NATHAN	RASOR	ROSFELD	SELDES	TAYLOR	WILSON	WRIGHT	AVERAGE		BRON	MCBRIDE	MCNIVEN	NATHAN	RASOR	ROSFELD	SELDES	TAYLOR	WILSON	WRIGHT	AVERAGE	
Abelard - - - -	0	0	0	2	0	6	10	1	15	6	4.0	Douglas Fairbanks -	6	25	5	0	0	-9	-20	8	-5	-10	0	-2
Franklin P. Adams -	5	0	15	5	1	-25	0	16	2	-10	.9	Elsie Ferguson - -	1	-25	0	2	0	-2	-1	0	0	1	0	0
Henry Adams - - -	1	25	20	0	25	10	10	11	6	0	10.7	Henry Fielding - -	18	25	20	13	0	13	5	17	5	8	12.4	
Aeschylus - - - -	0	20	20	12	25	24	12	21	20	0	15.4	Scott Fitzgerald -	5	0	8	10	7	-2	-20	0	2	0	1.0	
Sherwood Anderson -	11	10	15	8	25	10	14	10	10	4	11.7	Flaubert - - - -	9	15	20	20	25	17	20	10	15	17	16.8	
Aristotle - - - -	0	-5	25	15	20	25	21	20	25	21	16.7	Marshall Foch - -	4	6	0	0	0	-1	-1	1	0	10	1.9	
Saint Augustine - -	0	0	-20	-5	2	15	1	17	-10	0	0	William Z. Foster -	4	0	15	0	0	7	1	9	5	0	4.1	
Bach - - - - -	0	25	25	25	24	25	22	24	25	25	22.0	Henry Ford - - -	8	25	0	0	0	-25	-22	17	0	-25	-2.2	
Leon Bakst - - -	12	-6	2	1	-25	1	4	15	1	-18	-1.3	Anatole France - -	21	25	20	20	25	5	22	21	20	12	19.1	
Theda Bara - - -	-5	3	15	1	0	1	-2	-19	-2	-25	-3.3	Saint Francis - -	0	0	0	0	25	25	20	20	20	0	11.0	
Henri Barbusse -	8	-4	0	-14	0	13	-5	19	5	1	2.3	Benjamin Franklin	6	20	12	0	10	-11	-22	10	10	2	3.7	
George Gray Barnard	0	18	0	2	-25	-9	1	17	0	1	.5	Frederick the Great	1	10	25	24	0	5	-15	-10	-5	15	5.0	
John Barrymore -	10	0	0	0	1	0	2	-5	-12	1	-2	Sigmund Freud - -	19	4	10	5	2	17	15	12	15	-25	7.4	
Beethoven - - -	0	25	25	25	24	19	0	22	25	25	19.0	Mary Garden - - -	8	3	0	0	25	4	16	14	1	15	8.6	
George Bellows - -	9	-1	0	2	10	-1	0	12	1	-12	2.2	Judge Gary - - -	-10	0	-20	0	0	-20	-5	-24	25	9	-9.5	
Irving Berlin - -	4	0	10	7	22	1	18	10	0	0	7.2	Gilbert & Sullivan	14	25	22	24	5	4	12	20	15	15	12.8	
Saint Bernard - -	0	0	0	-25	0	11	0	18	-25	0	-2.1	Giorgione - - -	0	25	0	2	20	14	5	17	20	25	12.8	
Maxwell Bodenheim	0	1	0	-25	25	3	5	0	-2	0	-7	Lillian Gish - - -	2	8	17	17	1	-1	-22	5	0	-24	-.3	
Brahms - - - -	0	6	25	23	25	13	2	21	15	23	15.3	Yvette Guilbert -	9	25	12	0	25	9	12	10	15	1	11.8	
Fanny Brice - - -	3	0	10	2	25	1	17	16	1	-25	5.0	Elinor Glyn - - -	-15	-25	-25	-17	0	-6	-11	-3	-25	-12.8		
Briggs - - - -	7	-25	10	2	5	1	2	17	0	1	2.0	Goethe - - - -	6	25	23	25	22	25	15	14	23	20	19.8	
Robert Browning -	-2	11	2	3	15	17	2	25	12	-12	5.5	Samuel Gompers -	5	0	-25	-25	0	-24	-4	0	0	-25	-9.8	
W. J. Bryan - - -	9	-25	-25	0	0	-20	-16	-10	-15	-25	-12.7	Francis Hackett -	8	-12	12	10	0	1	8	1	0	0	2.9	
Nicholas Murray Butler	-10	-25	-25	0	0	-25	-20	-23	-23	-25	-17.6	Warren C. Harding	6	-25	-25	0	0	-5	0	0	-24	0	-7.3	
James Branch Cabell	10	-5	20	17	25	-13	-17	23	2	-13	4.9	Frank Harris - -	11	-25	15	5	5	2	1	7	2	3	3.6	
John Alden Carpenter	0	3	-20	1	5	-3	3	18	1	0	.8	Hawthorne - - -	7	14	20	0	4	5	3	12	1	-7	5.9	
Georges Carpentier	7	5	-20	-20	0	1	0	6	-15	0	-3.6	Wm. R. Hearst - -	-20	4	20	21	20	-20	11	-25	-25	10	-.4	
Catullus - - - -	0	0	0	3	20	14	8	1	25	12	8.3	James Huneker -	7	2	20	22	20	2	-17	18	1	16	9.1	
Cézanne - - - -	0	25	5	2	25	17	18	15	25	25	15.7	Robert Henri - -	0	-17	0	0	11	-2	0	18	1	15	2.6	
Charlie Chaplin -	18	25	10	6	25	3	25	10	25	25	17.2	O. Henry - - - -	11	20	-20	-16	1	-4	-15	4	1	-25	-4.3	
Robert W. Chambers	-5	-25	-20	-25	0	-17	10	-25	-25	-14.2	Homér - - - -	0	20	20	16	25	25	14	13	20	4	15.7		
G. K. Chesterton -	6	-24	-10	1	0	-5	1	10	-10	-22	-3.3	Arthur Hopkins -	3	-19	5	13	0	-10	1	6	1	1	-.1	
Howard Chandler Christy	-5	-25	-25	0	0	-19	-20	-13	-25	0	-13.2	Charles E. Hughes	7	-24	-25	0	0	1	-5	11	0	21	-5.6	
Cicero - - - -	0	20	0	5	0	-10	0	5	0	0	2.5	Victor Hugo - - -	11	14	-10	-2	10	11	-5	19	1	15	6.8	
Joseph Conrad -	17	-5	20	20	0	-8	20	25	10	25	14.4	Huyssmans - - -	0	0	0	12	23	10	-15	12	2	2	4.6	
James Fenimore Cooper	-2	-15	-20	0	0	-2	-1	9	0	1	-2.6	Ibanez - - - -	2	-25	-25	-25	0	-17	-25	-1	0	-25	-14.1	
Frank Crane - - -	-3	-25	0	-25	0	-25	-19	-17	-10	-25	-14.9	Ibsen - - - -	15	20	10	18	0	0	21	27	17	5	12.7	
Herbert Croly - -	-4	-25	10	0	5	1	1	17	10	0	1.5	Ingres - - - -	0	25	-20	0	0	18	7	15	-15	-1	5.9	
Dante - - - -	0	25	-20	13	25	25	17	12	25	-15	10.7	Henry James - -	4	9	10	5	21	10	25	20	15	14	13.3	
De Valera - - -	-20	-10	0	0	0	1	-12	20	3	1	-1.7	William James - -	8	11	15	4	10	9	1	17	10	-15	7.0	
Coningsby Dawson -	-21	0	-25	0	-25	-25	-22	-25	0	0	-16.8	Thomas Jefferson	17	0	10	12	-15	4	5	10	10	12	6.5	
Claude Debussy - -	8	2	18	2	20	13	16	23	10	7	11.9	Maria Jeritta - -	10	8	0	3	0	3	9	22	0	24	7.9	
Floyd Dell - - -	9	0	5	0	1	-10	-15	8	1	2	.1	Joan of Arc - - -	15	0	0	-24	0	12	-5	23	2	0	3.3	
Jack Dempsey - -	8	25	5	10	25	3	1	4	-20	0	6.1	Augustus John - -	0	4	0	0	-25	2	-1	16	0	-15	-1.9	
Charles Dickens -	13	25	10	4	5	11	20	18	15	-24	9.7	Dr. Johnson - - -	16	25	5	7	-25	11	16	16	2	3	7.6	
John Dos Passos -	7	3	10	1	10	3	5	16	2	1	5.8	Al Jolson - - - -	4	5	0	7	-25	1	20	0	0	0	1.2	
Theodore Dreiser -	5	0	20	12	15	4	1	10	1	14	8.2	Robert Edmond Jones	5	-16	5	2	16	1	14	19	1	1	4.8	
Max Eastman - -	6	0	10	2	0	-2	-2	10	1	-15	1.4	James Joyce - - -	0	10	15	2	25	13	20	12	13	5	11.5	
Professor Einstein -	0	4	10	-10	3	15	10	19	24	14	8.5	Kant - - - -	0	12	18	8	0	-23	-6	0	23	5	8.3	
T. S. Eliot - - -	0	0	0	0	25	4	17	11	7	0	6.4	Kipling - - - -	19	6	20	8	0	-8	0	15	1	-1	5.8	
George Eliot - -	11	0	0	0	0	6	0	-20	0	0	2.7	Krazy Kat - - -	2	0	0	-25	25	0	23	24	2	25	7.5	
Emerson - - - -	6	25	10	2	5	8	2	4	10	16	8.8	King Lear - - -	16	6	10	10	7	1	4	10	2	13	7.9	
Jacob Epstein - -	0	3	0	0	-25	7	1	18	0	2	6	Stephen Leacock -	9	4	5	5	0	-2	-19	9	-1	1	-1.1	
Erasmus - - - -	0	25	0	0	0	15	1	21	15	0	7.7	Mlle. Lenglen - -	4	2	0	-25	0	-24	0	-4	0	0	-4.7	
Geraldine Farrar -	3	2	10	10	0	-8	-21	5	-5	-18	-2.2	Lenin - - - -	13	15	-25	-25	0	8	8	18	13	-25	0	

	BROUN	McBRIDE	McKENN	NATHAN	RASCOE	ROSFELD	SELDES	TAYLOR	WILSON	WRIGHT	AVERAGE		BROUN	McBRIDE	McKENN	NATHAN	RASCOE	ROSFELD	SELDES	TAYLOR	WILSON	WRIGHT	AVERAGE	
Leonard	9	25	0	10	24	22	21	20	20	23	17.4	Jean Jacques Rousseau	6	25	10	6	0	15	-15	12	12	10	8.1	
Sinclair Lewis	12	0	10	1	3	1	-15	0	3	-8	.7	Rudin	4	0	-10	7	-25	6	-16	-8	-4	-25	-6.1	
Lloyd George	10	5	-25	-1	0	-20	-17	0	-25	-9	-9.3	Bertrand Russell	14	9	-15	7	1	6	16	15	10	0	5.6	
Henry Cabot Lodge	2	-22	-25	-11	0	-23	-17	-20	-25	-20	-16.1	Babe Ruth	19	25	-25	-25	25	1	-24	5	-25	-25	-4.9	
Amey Lowell	7	-11	0	1	3	2	12	8	-23	8	.7	Sappho	0	0	0	25	25	6	7	23	25	7	11.1	
Ludendorff	0	0	23	17	0	1	1	-1	-20	18	3.9	Arnold Schoenberg	0	6	5	-1	20	-5	15	-25	5	11	3.1	
George Luks	0	7	0	2	13	-2	1	12	1	1	3.5	Walter Scott	6	6	0	1	-25	-4	-17	-20	1	2	-5.8	
Luther	9	0	-25	-16	0	23	0	20	15	-25	.1	Shakespeare	19	25	25	25	25	25	20	22	21	17	22.4	
Edward MacDowell	0	6	5	0	5	1	5	17	1	0	4.0	George Bernard Shaw	23	3	15	14	-21	4	23	22	16	-20	7.9	
Marilynn Miller	7	0	0	3	0	1	0	8	0	1	2.0	Shelley	5	25	0	14	17	18	11	10	16	7	12.3	
Bishop Manning	-15	0	-25	-7	0	-25	0	9	-25	0	-8.8	Clare Sheridan	7	-25	-25	0	0	-2	-4	0	-25	0	-7.4	
Paul ManSHIP	-14	-15	0	0	10	-25	2	10	1	-15	-2.2	John Siddall	-1	0	8	5	0	0	-24	-21	-25	-15	-7.3	
Marcus Aurelius	0	25	0	1	-25	5	-12	17	0	3.4	Mr. Addison Sims of Seattle	-15	0	0	-25	0	0	0	-1	-25	0	-6.7		
John Masefield	-15	5	5	1	7	-3	-6	24	10	2	6.0	Upton Sinclair	6	0	0	0	0	1	-6	2	1	-22	-1.8	
Edgar Lee Masters	-13	5	5	1	7	2	-7	-18	2	-20	2.6	Sophocles	0	25	0	8	18	20	-16	22	23	16	11.6	
Matisse	0	18	0	2	20	14	8	6	8	15	9.1	Stravinsky	-14	11	1	2	20	9	6	19	10	-10	8.2	
Lorenzo de' Medici	0	25	20	20	0	9	1	12	10	25	12.2	John S. Sumner	-24	0	-25	0	-25	-25	-25	-25	-25	-25	-17.6	
H. L. Mencken	7	8	5	0	20	1	5	17	10	12	8.5	Billy Sunday	-23	0	-25	-25	-25	-25	-25	-25	-25	-25	-21.8	
John Stuart Mill	11	0	10	8	0	15	0	15	12	0	7.1	Tagore	-2	0	-20	-20	-25	2	-5	9	1	-25	-8.5	
Edna Millay	12	1	0	1	17	-1	-10	21	10	2	5.3	Sara Teasdale	2	0	8	5	-25	-1	0	2	3	0	-2.6	
John Milton	0	25	0	14	-15	12	5	22	20	12	7.1	Tennyson	4	-2	10	10	-25	5	4	16	10	-12	2.0	
George Moore	-10	-9	15	12	21	10	10	5	2	18	9.4	Titian	0	25	0	3	10	19	5	0	15	25	11.6	
Marianne Moore	0	0	0	-22	10	3	4	0	-2	0	-7	Tolstoi	16	2	-20	3	0	19	10	0	15	-20	2.6	
Paul Elmer More	0	0	10	-17	-25	3	2	-10	2	0	-3.5	New York Tribune	4	-25	-25	0	0	-25	-5	-14	-25	0	-11.5	
Eli Nadelman	0	4	0	-25	-25	6	1	10	0	1	-2.8	Unknown Soldier	0	0	0	0	25	-25	0	10	0	0	-1.5	
George Jean Nathan	2	7	0	20	-1	1	17	2	0	0	5.3	Louis Untermeyer	7	-5	12	12	1	1	0	6	1	5	4.0	
Nietzsche	5	25	25	13	25	21	25	20	10	21	19.0	Henry Van Dyke	1	-12	-10	-18	-25	-25	-5	-5	-24	-25	-14.8	
Lord Northcliffe	-6	-3	-25	4	0	-20	-13	-4	-25	-25	-11.7	Virgil	0	10	-10	8	6	12	5	5	20	4	6.0	
Eugene O'Neill	8	4	10	15	10	1	6	15	1	8	7.8	Voltaire	13	25	25	8	3	20	21	21	20	8	16.4	
Walter Pater	0	16	5	19	10	10	19	0	5	-10	7.4	Richard Wagner	11	20	25	20	15	19	18	25	18	10	18.1	
Saint Paul	0	25	10	0	0	11	1	-25	2	-25	-1	Hugh Walpole	4	0	5	5	0	13	-17	4	-4	-10	-2.6	
Petrarch	0	25	0	1	0	5	1	15	5	4	5.6	John Wanamaker	0	25	-20	0	0	1	0	15	-16	0	.5	
Picasso	0	13	0	1	20	18	19	0	4	20	9.5	George Washington	13	25	25	25	25	5	0	21	8	18	16.5	
Mary Pickford	5	8	0	0	1	-17	8	0	0	-18	-1.4	Frederick Watts	0	3	0	0	0	0	-6	-5	4	-1	-25	-3.0
Plato	7	25	25	5	18	25	3	25	25	7	16.5	John V. A. Weaver	7	0	0	0	0	0	0	7	1	4	1.9	
Esra Pound	0	4	10	2	20	4	16	-10	-10	5	4.1	H. G. Wells	19	0	20	10	0	3	2	23	10	-17	7.8	
Praxiteles	0	25	0	17	10	5	5	24	25	22	13.3	Edith Wharton	8	-15	5	8	8	1	5	15	15	5	5.5	
Racine	0	6	0	15	0	18	5	0	15	0	5.9	Whistler	9	4	20	7	20	5	1	25	15	-20	8.6	
Raphael	0	25	0	15	0	18	-4	20	12	8	9.4	Walt Whitman	21	25	20	20	20	10	22	18	-18	15	10.8	
Renoir	0	12	0	3	15	17	6	17	10	25	10.5	Oscar Wilde	11	15	5	16	5	4	16	20	3	10	10.5	
James Whitcomb Riley	-10	0	-20	-15	0	1	-20	7	-1	-24	-8.4	Woodrow Wilson	4	25	-25	-20	0	-20	0	12	-25	-2	2.9	
E. A. Robinson	5	0	5	-15	12	3	12	5	7	6	3.5	Wordsworth	2	20	5	2	-25	8	0	-1	18	-10	-1.9	
Dr. Wm. Robinson	6	0	5	0	0	-4	6	0	2	5	2.0	Ed Wynn	13	0	0	2	20	1	5	22	0	0	6.8	
Rodin	-20	16	10	20	10	6	9	25	15	-25	10.6	William Butler Yeats	2	-10	10	2	15	4	22	17	25	3	9.0	
Theodore Roosevelt	7	7	-20	-20	0	-10	-9	0	-25	-25	-9.5	Flo Ziegfeld	4	0	10	10	3	1	6	5	1	10	5.0	
Edmond Rostand	-18	-20	2	18	2	-15	-18	9	-10	0	-1.4													

## The First and the Last, and Some of Those Who Tied

The table of values above shows the following results:

The fifteen highest are: Shakespeare 22.4, Bach 22, Goethe 19.8, Anatole France 19.1, Beethoven 19, Nietzsche 19, Wagner 18.1, Leonardo Da Vinci 17.4, Charlie Chaplin 17.2, Flaubert 16.8, Aristotle 16.7, Plato 16.5, George Washington 16.5, Voltaire 16.4, Walt Whitman 15.8.

The fifteen lowest are: Theodore Roosevelt -9.5, New York Tribune -11.5, Lord Northcliffe -11.7, W. J. Bryan -12.7, Elinor Glynn -12.8, Howard Chandler Christy -13.2, Ibsen -14.1, Robert W. Chambers

-14.2, Henry Van Dyke -14.8, Frank Crane -14.9, Henry Cabot Lodge -16.1, Coningsby Dawson -16.8, Nicholas Murray Butler -17.6, John S. Sumner -17.6, Billy Sunday -21.8.

It will be noticed that for the following names, some with high and some with low ratings, are tied: Dr. Johnson and Krazy Kat; Martin Luther and Floyd Dell; St. Augustine, Lenin and Douglas Fairbanks; Flo Ziegfeld and Frederick the Great; Geraldine Farrar and Henry Ford; Lord Tennyson and Marilyn Miller; William Wordsworth and John V. A. Weaver; Cézanne and Homer.

## Who the Ten Critics Are

*Heywood Brown*, in his column in the *World* and through other mediums, discourses wittily and humanly on books and plays.

*Henry McBride* is, among the established critics of art, the most hospitable to the modernist. He is art critic for the *Sun* and a monthly contributor to *The Dial*.

*H. L. Mencken* is, with Mr. Nathan, co-editor of the *Smart Set* and the most vigorous opponent of the Puritan tradition in American letters.

*George Jean Nathan* is the arch-enemy of all that is sentimental, provincial and pretentious in American drama.

*Burton Rascoe* is an enthusiastic supporter of the modern aesthetic creeds in literature and art.

*Paul Rosenfeld* combines a wide knowledge of the past, with a fervid appreciation of the modern movements in music, letters and painting.

*Gilbert Seldes*, managing editor of *The Dial*, subjects modern literary experiment to an uncompromising comparison with the accomplishments of the great.

*Deems Taylor*, musical critic of the *World*, is generous enough to the new which seems to him authentic, without losing his actual allegiance to the old.

*Edmund Wilson*, Jr., contributor of critical essays to the *New Republic* and *Vanity Fair*, upholds the classic tradition of symmetry and form.

*Willard Huntington Wright* has written extensively on music, painting and letters. He is in full sympathy with the moderns.